- 1. DRAFT MINUTES OF THE HEARING HELD ON 24 MARCH 2025
- 2. DRAFT MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 26 MARCH 2025
- 3. DRAFT MINUTES OF THE HEARING HELD ON 10 & 11 APRIL 2025

Minutes (Draft)

Council Hearing held Monday 24 March 2025 at 1:30 pm **Council Chamber, Rotorua Lakes Council**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mayor Tapsell (Chair)

Cr Kai Fong (Deputy Chair), Cr Barker, Cr Lee, Cr Maxwell,

Cr Brown, Cr O'Brien, Cr Paterson

MEMBERS PRESENT VIA Cr Wang

AUDIO VISUAL LINK:

NO ATTENDANCE: Cr Kereopa and Cr Waru

STAFF PRESENT: T Collé, Group Manager, Organisational Performance & Innovation;

A Wilson, Group Manager, Community Experience;

P Warbrick, Manahautū Te Arawa Hourua;

D Jensen, Chief Financial Officer;

G Kieck, Manager - Governance, Strategy & Compliance;

G Konara, Governance & Democracy Advisor;

The hearing opened at 1.33pm.

The Mayor welcomed elected members, media, staff and members of the public.

1 KARAKIA WHAKAPUAKI – OPENING KARAKIA

Cr Barker opened the meeting with a Karakia.

NGĀ WHAKAPĀHA - APOLOGIES

Nil

WHAKAPUAKITANGA WHAIPĀNGA – DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST 3

Cr Paterson noted that he has family connections with one of the submitters.

4 PŪRONGO KAIMAHI – STAFF REPORTS

4.1 HEARINGS FOR PROPOSED DISPOSAL OF RANGINUI STREET RESERVE

RESOLVED C 25/03-021

Moved: Cr Kai Fong Seconded: Cr O'Brien

1. That the report 'Hearings for Proposed Disposal of Ranginui Street Reserve' be received.

CARRIED

Following submitters spoke to their submissions:

No Name

- 1 Dr. Hon Te Ururoa Flavell
- 2 Karl Leonard

5 TE KARAKIA WHAKAMUTUNGA – CLOSING KARAKIA

Cr Barker closed the hearing with a Karakia.

The hearing closed at 1.51pm.

To be confirmed at the Council meeting on 30 April 2025.

Note: -Rotorua Lakes Council is the operating name of Rotorua District Council

Minutes (Draft)

Council meeting held Wednesday 26 March 2025 at 9:30 am Council Chamber, Rotorua Lakes Council

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mayor Tapsell (Chair)

Cr Kai Fong (Deputy Chair), Cr Barker, Cr Kereopa, Cr Lee, Cr Maxwell, Cr Brown, Cr O'Brien, Cr Paterson, Cr Waru

MEMBERS PRESENT VIA AUDIO VISUAL LINK:

Cr Wang

APOLOGIES: Cr Kereopa for lateness

STAFF PRESENT: A Moraes, Chief Executive;

T Collé, Group Manager, Organisational Performance & Innovation;

J-P Gaston, Group Manager, Destination Development; S Michael, Group Manager, Infrastructure and Assets; A Wilson, Group Manager, Community Experience;

P Warbrick, Manahautū Te Arawa Hourua;

D Jensen, Chief Financial Officer;

R George, Director - Infrastructure and Environment;

R Brelsford-Smith, Strategic Financial Planner;

G Kieck, Manager - Governance, Strategy & Compliance;

I Tiriana, Communications Manager;

R Dunn, Senior Governance & Democracy Advisor; G Konara, Governance & Democracy Advisor.

The meeting opened at 9.31am.

The Mayor welcomed elected members, media, staff and members of the public.

1 KARAKIA WHAKAPUAKI – OPENING KARAKIA

Cr O'Brien opened the meeting with a Karakia.

Attendance: Cr Waru joined the meeting at 9.32am.

2 NGĀ WHAKAPĀHA – APOLOGIES

RESOLVED C 25/03-021

Moved: Cr Barker Seconded: Cr O'Brien

1. That the apologies from Cr Kereopa for lateness be accepted.

CARRIED

3 WHAKAPUAKITANGA WHAIPĀNGA – DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Nil

4 NGĀ TAKE WHAWHATI TATA KĀORE I TE RĀRANGI TAKE – URGENT ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Following minor matters were raised:

Cr O'Brien – Referred to the discussions at the Audit and Risk Committee meeting held on 25th
March 2025 on having an internal audit programme and asked whether the council has set
aside finance for such a programme.

Attendance: Cr Kereopa joined the meeting at 9.33am.

The Chair informed that the staff can respond at the annual plan discussion under item 10.1 of this agenda.

• Cr Lee – Referred to the rules not allowing to bring placards to the Council chamber and asked the rules be explained to the general public.

The Chief Executive summarised the rules.

5 TE WHAKAŪ I NGĀ MENETI – CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

5.1 MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL MEETINGS HELD ON 26 FEBRUARY 2025 AND 05 MARCH 2025

RESOLVED C 25/03-022

Moved: Cr Kai Fong Seconded: Cr Barker

1. That the minutes of the Ordinary Council Meeting held 26 February 2025 be confirmed as a true and correct record.

2.	That the minutes of the Ordinary Council Meeting held 05 March 2025 be confirmed as a true and
	correct record.

CARRIED

6 TE PAPA KŌRERO MŌ TE TŪMATAWHĀNUI – PUBLIC FORUM

Nil

7 HE PUKA INOI TŪMATAWHĀNUI – PUBLIC PETITIONS

Nil

8 NGĀ WHAKAMŌHIOTANGA MŌTINI – NOTICES OF MOTION

Nil

9 NGĀ TĀPAETANGA – PRESENTATIONS

Nil

10 PŪRONGO KAIMAHI – STAFF REPORTS

10.1 ADOPT DRAFT ANNUAL PLAN CONSULTATION DOCUMENT 2025-2026 FOR PUBLIC CONSULTATION

RESOLVED C 25/03-023

Moved: Cr O'Brien Seconded: Cr Waru

1. That the report 'Adopt draft Annual Plan Consultation Document 2025-2026 for public consultation' be received.

CARRIED

Thomas Collé overviewed the report and spoke to a presentation titled "Adoption of Annual Plan 2025-26 consultation document" (ECM - 21211032).

The Chief Executive, referring to the matter raised by Cr O'Brien with regard to allocation of funds for an internal audit programme, noted that this will be discussed at the time of annual plan deliberations.

RESOLVED C 25/03-024

Moved: Mayor Tapsell Seconded: Cr Kai Fong

- 2. That Council approve the draft Annual Plan Consultation Document based on a proposed rates increase of 7.95%, a capital works programme of \$145 million and borrowing of \$41 million.
- 3. That Council approve to conduct public consultation on the draft Annual Plan 2025-2026 from 4 April 2025 to 5 May 2025.

CARRIED

The Chair ruled to consider item 10.3 next.

10.3 COMPLIANCE WITH FLUORIDATION DIRECTIVE DECISION

RESOLVED C 25/03-025

Moved: Cr Kai Fong Seconded: Cr Lee

1. That the report 'Compliance with Fluoridation Directive Decision' be received.

CARRIED

Stavros Michael overviewed the report.

Action Point

• Mayor Tapsell requested that the Ministry of Health and/or Director General of Health be contacted to ask them to undertake community information/advertising regarding fluoridation.

MOTION

Moved: Mayor Tapsell Seconded: Cr Kai Fong

2. That Council notes that the Chief Executive will comply with the directive of the Director-General of Health to commence water fluoridation as legally required under the Health (Fluoridation of Drinking Water) Amendment Act 2021. 3. That Council note that temporary arrangements are in place for public access to a non-fluoridated water supply tap for the Central and Eastern water supplies catchments.

Cr Lee moved the following amendment and Cr Barker seconded.

MOTION

Moved: Cr Lee Seconded: Cr Barker

- 2. That Council notes that the Chief Executive will comply with the directive of the Director-General of Health to commence water fluoridation as legally required under the Health (Fluoridation of Drinking Water) Amendment Act 2021.
- 3. That Council note that temporary arrangements are in place for public access to a non-fluoridated water supply tap for the Central and Eastern water supplies catchments.
- 4. That Council notes the following points:
 - a. that pursuant to section 116E the Director General of Health has the option of directing Local Authorities to either add or to not to add fluoride to drinking water. https://www.legislation.govt.nz/act/public/1956/0065/latest/LMS629891.html
 - b. that the Courts of New Zealand have identified that community water fluoridation is a "limitation" of New Zealander's right to refuse medical treatment (as per s11 of the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990).

Judgment of Radich J in the High Court of New Zealand, New Health New Zealand vs Director General of Health [2023] NZHC 3183 (attached) at paragraph [2]:

- [2] Fluoridation is a limit on the right in s 11 of the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990 (the Bill of Rights Act) to refuse medical treatment.1 The Director-General accepts that there is no reference to the Bill of Rights Act in the decision-making documents to which the decision relates. There is nothing on the record to show that, in making the decision, he turned his mind to whether, in terms of s 5 of the Bill of Rights Act, the limit is a reasonable limit prescribed by law such as can be demonstrably justified in a free and democratic society.
- c. That in August 2024 the United States Government's National Toxicology Program (NTP) released its eight-year review of fluoride and IQ studies. It found that 52 of 55 studies, including 18 out of 19 "high-quality" studies consistently demonstrate lower IQ scores are associated with higher fluoride exposure.

https://ntp.niehs.nih.gov/sites/default/files/ntp/about_ntp/bsc/2023/may/publiccomm/neurath20230429 bsc 508.pdf

d. That in September 2024 the United States Federal Court found that "that fluoridation of water at 0.7 milligrams per litre ... poses an unreasonable risk of reduced IQ in children".

e. That in October 2024 the Cochrane Collaboration, which is relied upon by the Director General of Health, found that:

"The evidence suggests that water fluoridation may slightly reduce tooth decay in children," says co-author Dr Lucy O'Malley, Senior Lecturer in Health Services Research at the University of Manchester. "Given that the benefit has reduced over time, before introducing a new fluoridation scheme, careful thought needs to be given to costs, acceptability, feasibility and ongoing monitoring."

f. As a result of the above many communities in the United States have stopped fluoridation of community water supplies.

<u>Utah will be the first state to ban fluoride in dhttps://apnews.com/article/fluoride-ban-drinking-water-utah-559d92736f1958ff5d109071fa85f5b5rinking water | AP News</u>

https://www.wusf.org/health-news-florida/2024-11-22/florida-surgeon-general-advises-communities-to-stop-adding-fluoride-to-drinking-water-supply

https://www.miaminewtimes.com/news/florida-cities-stop-adding-fluoride-to-water-heres-the-list-22372824

g. Research in the field is ongoing with significant new studies released in 2025 confirming and expanding upon the findings of the NTP.

https://jamanetwork.com/journals/jamapediatrics/fullarticle/2828425

Prenatal and childhood exposure to fluoride and cognitive development: findings from the longitudinal MINIMat cohort in rural Bangladesh | Environmental Health Perspectives | Vol. 0, No. 0 (https://ehp.niehs.nih.gov/doi/10.1289/EHP14534)

- h. Community Water Fluoridation continues to be controversial with many in the community genuinely concerned and strongly opposed to it.
- i. There hasn't been a Commission of Inquiry into Community Water Fluoridation in New Zealand since 1957.

Report of the Commission of Inquiry on the fluoridation of public water supplies by New Zealand. Commission of Inquiry on the Fluoridation of Public Water Supplies | Open Library

(https://openlibrary.org/books/OL32859766M/Report of the Commission of Inquiry on the fluoridation of public water supplies)

5. That the Chief Executive and chair of the Infrastructure & Environment Committee be directed to jointly write to the Prime Minister requesting a Commission of Inquiry into the safety, efficacy & cost-effectiveness of fluoridation in New Zealand.

The recommendations from number 4.a to 4.i and number 5 were taken in parts to seek agreement from the majority of the members to amend the original motion.

Reco	ommendation	Agreed for	Disagreed	Majority
	That Council notes the following points:	an	for an	.,,
	01	amendment	amendment	
a.	that pursuant to section 116E the Director General of			
-	Health has the option of directing Local Authorities to			
	either add or to not to add fluoride to drinking water.	6	5	For
	c.m.c. dad or to not to dad indefine to drinking water.		_	
b.	that the Courts of New Zealand have identified that			
	community water fluoridation is a "limitation" of New			
	Zealander's right to refuse medical treatment (as per	5	6	Against
	s11 of the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990).			- Games
	0 = 1 0 · 0 · 0 · 0 · 0 · 0 · 0 · 0 · 0 · 0			
C.	That in August 2024 the United States Government's	. •		
	National Toxicology Program (NTP) released its eight-			
	year review of fluoride and IQ studies. It found that 52			
	of 55 studies, including 18 out of 19 "high-quality"	5	6	Against
	studies consistently demonstrate lower IQ scores are			, .Baillot
	associated with higher fluoride exposure.			_
	associated with higher hadride exposure.			
d.	That in September 2024 the United States Federal			
۵.	Court found that "that fluoridation of water at 0.7			
	milligrams per litre poses an unreasonable risk of	5	6	Against
	reduced IQ in children".		ŭ	/ iguilist
	Teadeed IQ III cililateit .			
е.	That in October 2024 the Cochrane Collaboration,			
	which is relied upon by the Director General of Health,			
	found that:			
	"The evidence suggests that water fluoridation may			
	slightly reduce tooth decay in children," says co-author			
	Dr Lucy O'Malley, Senior Lecturer in Health Services			
	Research at the University of Manchester. "Given that	5	6	Against
	the benefit has reduced over time, before introducing a			
	new fluoridation scheme, careful thought needs to be			
	given to costs, acceptability, feasibility and ongoing			
	monitoring."			
f.	As a result of the above many communities in the			
	United States have stopped fluoridation of community	4	6	Against
	water supplies.			J
		(1 abst	(1 abstained)	
g.	Research in the fie <mark>ld is</mark> ongoing with significant new	•	-	
	studies released in 2025 confirming and expanding	_		
	upon the findings of the NTP.	5	6	Against
h.	Community Water Fluoridation continues to be		6	
	controversial with many in the community genuinely	5	(Including	Against
	concerned and strongly opposed to it.		casting vote)	
		(1 abstained)		
i.	There hasn't been a Commission of Inquiry into			
	Community Water Fluoridation in New Zealand since	7	4	For
	1957.	′	+	רטו

The meeting adjourned at 11.50am and resumed at 12.03pm.

Cr Lee as the mover, suggested the following alteration to recommendation 5 with the agreement of Cr Barker as the seconder and sought councillors' agreement for the alteration.

Recommendation	Agreed for	Disagreed	Majority
	an	for an	
	amendment	amendment	
5. That the elected members consult with the Chief			
Executive to write to the Prime Minister requesting a		2	For
Commission of Inquiry into the safety, efficacy & cost-	8	3	For
effectiveness of fluoridation in New Zealand.			

With the agreement of the majority of the councillors, the following motion then became the substantive motion.

MOTION

Moved: Mayor Tapsell Seconded: Cr Kai Fong

- 2. That Council notes that the Chief Executive will comply with the directive of the Director-General of Health to commence water fluoridation as legally required under the Health (Fluoridation of Drinking Water) Amendment Act 2021.
- 3. That Council note that temporary arrangements are in place for public access to a non-fluoridated water supply tap for the Central and Eastern water supplies catchments.
- 4. That Council notes the following points:
 - a. that pursuant to section 116E the Director General of Health has the option of directing Local Authorities to either add or to not to add fluoride to drinking water.

 https://www.legislation.govt.nz/act/public/1956/0065/latest/LMS629891.html
 - b. there hasn't been a Commission of Inquiry into Community Water Fluoridation in New Zealand since 1957.

Report of the Commission of Inquiry on the fluoridation of public water supplies by New Zealand. Commission of Inquiry on the Fluoridation of Public Water Supplies | Open Library (https://openlibrary.org/books/OL32859766M/Report of the Commission of Inquiry on the fluoridation of public water supplies)

5. That the elected members consult with the Chief Executive to write to the Prime Minister requesting a Commission of Inquiry into the safety, efficacy & cost-effectiveness of fluoridation in New Zealand.

Cr Paterson moved the following amendment to recommendation number 2 above and Cr Kereopa seconded:

MOTION

Moved: Cr Paterson Seconded: Cr Kereopa

- 2. That Council notes that the Chief Executive will comply with the directive of the Director-General of Health to commence water fluoridation, upon reporting to Council on the outcome of due diligence checks with the "Supplier" regarding:
 - 1) the origin of the Phosphate Rock used in the production of the Hydrofluorosilicic Acid (HFA) to be injected, as per the:
 - Government Procurement Principles Supplier Code of Conduct "...expects its suppliers to: adhere to international human rights standards in their workplace and monitor and address these standards within their supply chain" and the Government Procurement Charter which directs agencies to "...Ensure that the businesses you contract with, operate with integrity, transparency and accountability, and respect international standards relating to human and labour rights."
 - 2) whether or not the Phosphate Rock used in the production of the Hydrofluorosilicic Acid (HFA) to be injected, contains Uranium, as per Schedule 1 of the New Zealand Nuclear Free, Disarmament and Arms Control Act 1987, which states "The Parties of this Treaty (are) DETERMINED to keep the region free of environmental pollution by radioactive wastes and other radioactive matter"

The Chair noted that under standing order 23.5 an amendment cannot be a direct negative. Therefore, noted that the above amendment cannot be carried forward.

Cr Paterson proposed to alter the recommendation as below:

- 2. That Council notes that the Chief Executive will comply with the directive of the Director-General of Health to commence water fluoridation and report back to Council on the outcome of due diligence checks with the "Supplier" regarding:
 - 1) the origin of the Phosphate Rock used in the production of the Hydrofluorosilicic Acid (HFA) to be injected, as per the:
 - Government Procurement Principles Supplier Code of Conduct "...expects its suppliers to: adhere to international human rights standards in their workplace and monitor and address these standards within their supply chain" and the Government Procurement Charter which directs agencies to "...Ensure that the businesses you contract with, operate with integrity, transparency and accountability, and respect international standards relating to human and labour rights."
 - whether or not the Phosphate Rock used in the production of the Hydrofluorosilicic Acid (HFA) to be injected, contains Uranium, as per Schedule 1 of the New Zealand Nuclear Free, Disarmament and Arms Control Act 1987, which states "The Parties of this Treaty (are) DETERMINED to keep the region free of environmental pollution by radioactive wastes and other radioactive matter"

A show of hands was requested for agreement /disagreement for the proposed alteration and a majority (6) agreed to alter the recommendation.

Then the agreement from the majority was sought to amend the recommendation number 2 in the substantive motion by replacing the existing recommendation number 2 with the above recommendation.

Recommendation	Agreed for an amendment	Disagreed for an amendment	Majority
2. That Council notes that the Chief Executive will comply with the directive of the Director-General of Health to commence water fluoridation and report back to Council on the outcome of due diligence checks with the "Supplier" regarding:			
 the origin of the Phosphate Rock used in the production of the Hydrofluorosilicic Acid (HFA) to be injected, as per the: 			
Government Procurement Principles - Supplier Code of Conduct — "expects its suppliers to: adhere to international human rights standards in their workplace and monitor and address these standards within their supply chain" and the Government Procurement Charter which directs agencies to "Ensure that the businesses you contract with, operate with integrity, transparency and accountability, and respect international standards relating to human and labour rights."	4	5 (Including casting vote)	Against
2) whether or not the Phosphate Rock used in the production of the Hydrofluorosilicic Acid (HFA) to be injected, contains Uranium, as per Schedule 1 of the New Zealand Nuclear Free, Disarmament and Arms Control Act 1987, which states "The Parties of this Treaty (are) DETERMINED to keep the region free of environmental pollution by radioactive wastes and other radioactive matter"	2 abstained		

Majority of the councillors were against amending the existing recommendation number 2 in the substantive motion.

The Chair requested Cr Kai Fong's statement referring to noting the legislation under recommendation 4.a be noted in the minutes.

Earlier in the meeting, Cr Kai Fong, referring to recommendation 4.a, noted that whilst section 116E says that the Director General of Health may direct a local authority to add or to not to add fluoride to drinking water, the second part of the legislation is relevant before making the directive. Cr Kai Fong noted that the legislation requires the Director General of Health to consider all of the scientific evidence, the state of the oral health, the number of people likely to be affected and the financial cost.

The Chair ruled to consider the substantive motion in parts as below:

RESOLVED C 25/03-026

Moved: Mayor Tapsell Seconded: Cr Kai Fong

- 2. That Council notes that the Chief Executive will comply with the directive of the Director-General of Health to commence water fluoridation as legally required under the Health (Fluoridation of Drinking Water) Amendment Act 2021.
- 3. That Council note that temporary arrangements are in place for public access to a non-fluoridated water supply tap for the Central and Eastern water supplies catchments.

In Favour: Mayor Tapsell, Cr Maxwell, Cr Kai Fong, Cr Brown, Cr O'Brien, Cr Wang and Cr Waru

<u>Against:</u> Cr Kereopa and Cr Paterson

Abstained: Cr Barker and Cr Lee

CARRIED 7/2

RESOLVED C 25/03-027

Moved: Mayor Tapsell Seconded: Cr Kai Fong

- 4. That Council notes the following points:
 - a. that pursuant to section 116E the Director General of Health has the option of directing Local Authorities to either add or to not to add fluoride to drinking water.

https://www.legislation.govt.nz/act/public/1956/0065/latest/LMS629891.html

b. there hasn't been a Commission of Inquiry into Community Water Fluoridation in New Zealand since 1957.

Report of the Commission of Inquiry on the fluoridation of public water supplies by New Zealand. Commission of Inquiry on the Fluoridation of Public Water Supplies | Open Library (https://openlibrary.org/books/OL32859766M/Report of the Commission of Inquiry on the fluoridation of public water supplies)

5. That the elected members consult with the Chief Executive to write to the Prime Minister requesting a Commission of Inquiry into the safety, efficacy & cost-effectiveness of fluoridation in New Zealand.

In Favour: Mayor Tapsell, Cr Barker, Cr Kereopa, Cr Lee, Cr Maxwell, Cr Brown, Cr O'Brien, Cr

Paterson, Cr Wang and Cr Waru

Against: Cr Kai Fong

CARRIED 10/1

The chair ruled to consider items 10.4 and 10.5 next.

10.4 FINANCIAL UPDATE - FEBRUARY 2025

RESOLVED C 25/03-028

Moved: Cr Waru Seconded: Cr Brown

1. That the report 'Financial Update - February 2025' be received.

CARRIED

David Jensen overviewed the report and spoke to a presentation titled "Financial Update – February 2025" (ECM -21211571).

10.5 2025 LOCAL GOVERNMENT NEW ZEALAND (LGNZ) SUPER LOCAL CONFERENCE

RESOLVED C 25/03-029

Moved: Cr O'Brien Seconded: Cr Waru

1. That the report '2025 Local Government New Zealand (LGNZ) Super Local Conference' be received.

CARRIED

The report was taken as read.

RESOLVED C 25/03-030

Moved: Cr O'Brien Seconded: Cr Barker

2. That the Council determine that Cr Trevor Maxwell will attend the 2025 LGNZ SuperLocal Conference with Mayor Tapsell, Cr Kai Fong and Chief Executive Andrew Moraes.

CARRIED

The meeting adjourned at 1.45pm.

Cr Wang left the meeting (via Zoom) at 1.45pm.

The meeting resumed at 2.16pm.

The Chair noted the apology from Cr Wang for early departure.

10.2 LOCAL WATER DONE WELL - OPTIONS FOR PROPOSED WATER SERVICES DELIVERY MODEL CONSULTATION DOCUMENT

RESOLVED C 25/03-031

Moved: Cr Brown Seconded: Cr Kereopa

1. That the report 'Local Water Done Well - Options for Proposed Water Services Delivery Model Consultation Document' be received.

CARRIED

Stavros Michael overviewed the report.

RESOLVED C 25/03-032

Moved: Mayor Tapsell Seconded: Cr Kai Fong

- 2. That Council adopt a preferred option in its Local Waters Done Well consultation document of an in-house Council waters division until 2028, with a decision in 2027 whether to have waters services delivered by a multi-council owned water services CCO or a Rotorua Lakes Council water services CCO.
- 3. That Council agree to include the alternative option of retaining in-house delivery of water services in the consultation document.

<u>In Favour:</u> Mayor Tapsell, Cr Barker, Cr Maxwell, Cr Kai Fong, Cr Brown, Cr O'Brien, Cr Paterson and

Cr Waru

Against: Cr Kereopa and Cr Lee

CARRIED 8/2

10.6 TE ARAWA PARTNERSHIPS PROGRESS REPORT

RESOLVED C 25/03-033

Moved: Cr Kereopa Seconded: Cr O'Brien

1. That the report 'Te Arawa Partnerships Progress Report' be received.

CARRIED

Paul Warbrick overviewed the report.

Action Point

 The Chair asked Stavros Michael to share the results of the survey that was carried out in the Ōhinemutu village relating to the proposed oneway street and also the communication that the Council staff have had with the Ōhinemutu village community to arrange a meeting to discuss the proposed options.

Attendance: Cr Brown left the meeting at 3.00pm.

10.7 MAYOR'S INTERNATIONAL TRAVEL REPORT - AUSTRALIA & CHINA 2025

RESOLVED C 25/03-034

Moved: Cr Maxwell Seconded: Cr Barker

1. That the report 'Mayor's International Travel Report - Australia & China 2025 ' be received.

CARRIED

Mayor Tapsell overviewed the report.

The Chair advised that the only matter in the public excluded session is to adopt the confidential minutes of the previous meetings and if there are no corrections or discussion required there is no requirement to move into Public Excluded.

11.1 CONFIDENTIAL MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL MEETINGS HELD ON 26 FEBRUARY 2025 AND 05 MARCH 2025

RESOLVED C 25/03-035

Moved: Cr O'Brien Seconded: Cr Kai Fong

- 1. That the confidential minutes of the Council Meeting held 26 February 2025 be confirmed as a true and correct record.
- 2. That the confidential minutes of the Council Meeting held 05 March 2025 be confirmed as a true and correct record.

CARRIED

12 TE KARAKIA WHAKAMUTUNGA – CLOSING KARAKIA

Cr O'Brien closed the meeting with a Karakia.

The Meeting closed at 3.22pm.

To be confirmed at the Council meeting on 30 April 2025.

Note: -Rotorua Lakes Council is the operating name of Rotorua District Council

Minutes (Draft)

Council Hearing held Thursday 10 April 2025 at 4:00 pm Council Chamber, Rotorua Lakes Council

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mayor Tapsell (Chair)

Cr Kai Fong (Deputy Chair), Cr Barker, Cr Maxwell, Cr O'Brien,

Cr Paterson, Cr Wang.

MEMBERS PRESENT VIA AUDIO VISUAL LINK:

Cr Brown

APOLOGIES: Cr Waru

NO ATTENDANCE: Cr Kereopa and Cr Lee

STAFF PRESENT: G Kieck, Manager - Governance, Strategy & Compliance;

G Konara, Governance & Democracy Advisor.

The hearing opened at 4.03pm.

The Mayor welcomed elected members, media, staff and members of the public.

1 KARAKIA WHAKAPUAKI – OPENING KARAKIA

Mayor Tapsell opened the hearing with a Karakia.

2 NGĀ WHAKAPĀHA – APOLOGIES

RESOLVED C 25/04-036

Moved: Cr Brown
Seconded: Cr O'Brien

1. That the apologies from Cr Waru be accepted.

CARRIED

3 WHAKAPUAKITANGA WHAIPĀNGA – DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Cr Brown declared conflict of interest.

4 PŪRONGO KAIMAHI – STAFF REPORTS

4.1 HEARINGS FOR LOCAL ALCOHOL POLICY REVIEW

RESOLVED C 25/04-037

Moved: Cr Kai Fong Seconded: Cr Maxwell

1. That the report 'Hearings for Local Alcohol Policy Review' be received.

CARRIED

Attendance: Cr wang joined the hearing at 4.05pm.

Following submitters spoke to their submissions:

No Name

- 1 Greg Hoar (via Zoom) Super Liquor Holdings Limited
- 2 Iain Thain (via Zoom) Foodstuffs North Island Limited
- 3 Ryan Gray (via Zoom)
- 4 Rotorua Youth Council

Mayor Tapsell closed the hearing for the day with a Karakia.

The hearing adjourned at 4.33pm.

Minutes (Draft)

Council Hearing held Friday 11 April 2025 at 9.00am Council Chamber, Rotorua Lakes Council

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mayor Tapsell (Chair)

Cr Kai Fong (Deputy Chair), Cr Barker, Cr Maxwell, , Cr O'Brien, Cr Paterson,

Cr Wang, Cr Waru

APOLOGIES: Cr Brown and Cr Lee

NO ATTENDANCE: Cr Kereopa

STAFF PRESENT: T Collé, Group Manager, Organisational Performance & Innovation;

G Kieck, Manager - Governance, Strategy & Compliance;

G Konara, Governance & Democracy Advisor.

The hearing resumed at 9.01am.

The Mayor welcomed elected members, media, staff and members of the public.

5 NGĀ WHAKAPĀHA — APOLOGIES

RESOLVED C 25/04-038

Moved: Cr Kai Fong Seconded: Cr O'Brien

1. That the apologies from Cr Brown and Cr Lee be accepted.

CARRIED

WHAKAPUAKITANGA WHAIPĀNGA – DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Following submitters spoke to their submissions:

No Name

5 Dr Lynne Lane - Health New Zealand (Tabled a document – attached to these minutes)

Attendance: Cr Waru attended the hearing at 9.08am.

No	Name
6	Paul Radich (via Zoom) - General Distributors Limited (Woolworths)
7	Reg Hennessy (Hennessy's Irish Bar)
8	Andrew Galloway and Jennifer Lamm (via Zoom) - Alcohol Healthwatch
9	Mem Jenner
10	Kerrin Tahata

7 TE KARAKIA WHAKAMUTUNGA – CLOSING KARAKIA

Cr Waru closed the hearing with a Karakia.

The hearing closed at 9.49am.

To be confirmed at the Council meeting on 30 April 2025.

Note: -Rotorua Lakes Council is the operating name of Rotorua District Council

Attachment 1 - Document tabled by Health New Zealand



Introduction

Mōrena Koutou

Ko Lynne Lane tōku ingoa -

I am a designated MOoH at Te Whatu Ora, based in Tauranga.

I am here with my team who are all based in Rotorua and can respond to any specific questions you may have.

Dawn Meertens - Technical Officer (28 years)

James Scarfe - Public Health Analyst (12 years)

Jody Huxford - Public Health Medicine Registrar

Renee Bolkowy - Health Improvement Advisor

Thank you for the opportunity to talk to Council regarding our feedback on the review of your draft Local Alcohol Policy.

In my role as a Designated Medical Officer of Health

I have various legislative powers and responsibilities to promote and protect the public health which is why we are here today.

- a) Under the Health Act 1956,
- b) Under the SSAA (2012) which is why we are here today
 - a. to consult with Councils on the development of a Local Alcohol
 - b. To inquire into all applications for licenses and to report any matters in opposition.
 - c. To attend compliance activities with Police and the Licencing Inspector.

My relevant experience

- Over 10 years clinical experience at Rotorua Hospital then as a GP in Taupo.
- I was the Mental Health Commissioner (to 2015) for 5 years during which time I submitted to select committee on the bill that became the "Sale and Supply of Alcohol Act 2012"

Te Kāwanatanga o Aotearoa New Zealand Government Health New Zealand
Te Whatu Ora

We acknowledge the work that the Council staff and elected members have completed and commend you on the draft policy.

My message is simple – we are concerned that the current LAP is not delivering on the Objects of the ACT and the draft LAP may not either, unless it is strengthened.

Our concerns are based on the following information.

- 1. The population profile this district which is quite unique it has a very high proportion of Māori, is relatively young, and has a large, and growing proportion of people living in decile 10 (the highest level of social deprivation). While your local population has many strengths, it is highly vulnerable to alcohol related harm.
- The levels of Alcohol related harm to health are increasing. Prior to COVID, the
 Health Indicators for alcohol related harm were decreasing and were below the
 national average. Since COVID, these indicators have steadily increased and are now
 tracking above the national average.
- 3. The risk of Foetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorder (FASD) and the costs are high

FASD is pre-natal harm caused by alcohol consumed during pregnancy when there is no safe level of alcohol consumption.

It often goes undiagnosed unless it is so severe that long-term intensive support is needed. We do not have reliable prevalence data for NZ; however, it is estimated that 30% of inmates in corrections have FASD.

Given the population profile and levels of drinking during pregnancy, your community is at risk of having relatively high rates of FASD.

The national cost of FASD is estimated to be \$4.8B which is 90% of the cost of alcohol harm inflicted on others. It is a major problem.

Unless the risk of FASD is reduced, as soon as possible, the adverse consequences for these individuals, their whanau and the whole community will be significant.

In summary, the level of alcohol related harm is comparatively high, and is increasing under your watch. The current policy settings are not minimising alcohol related harm but are enabling increasing levels of harm.

The Community is Concerned

They are expressing their concern in objections to licencing applications, in the submissions to council and in the *Community Alcohol Survey*.

 Of note the community recently set a national record for the number of objections to an off-licence application (in the order of 750).

Finally, a few comments on our submission

We recommend that Council take the strongest policy options available to minimise alcohol related harm.

We also suggest additional measures used by other Councils with good results.

There are four policies we consider important to include:

- 1. We support the proposed ban on new off licenses
- 2. We recommend reduced off licence trading hours from 9am-9pm
- 3. We recommend for all new off licences, to increase the exclusion distance from 200 to 400 metres from marae & education facilities
- 4. We recommend you require FASD signage in single alcohol areas, and signage at point of sale. Incidentally this policy would be a "NZ first" in combatting FASD.

In closing

We congratulate you on the work done to date. We hope you use this opportunity to be remembered as the Council that cared enough about the community to put in place a robust LAP to *minimise ARH* and "To make the healthy choice the easy choice".

3